

To the Accreditation Council of
the Eurasian Center for Accreditation and
Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Healthcare
December, 9, 2022

**REPORT
OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION
BASED ON THE RESULTS OF THE EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL
PROGRAMME IN THE SPECIALTY 7R01124 – "ONCOLOGY (ADULT)" OF
JSC "KAZAKH RESEARCH INSTITUTE OF ONCOLOGY AND
RADIOLOGY" FOR COMPLIANCE WITH THE STANDARDS FOR
PRIMARY ACCREDITATION OF POSTGRADUATE EDUCATION
PROGRAMMES (RESIDENCY SPECIALTIES) IN MEDICAL EDUCATIONAL
ORGANIZATIONS**
external expert evaluation period: November 28-30, 2022

Almaty, 2022

content

	List of symbols and abbreviations	2
1.	Composition of the external expert commission	3
2.	General part of the final report	4
2.1	Presentation of the educational programme in specialty 7R01124 - "Oncology (adult)"	4
2.2	Information about previous accreditation	5
2.3	Conclusion based on the results of reviewing the report on the self-assessment of the educational programme 7R01124 - "Oncology (adult)" for compliance with the Standards for primary accreditation of postgraduate education programmes (specialty residency) of medical educational organizations and conclusions	5
3.	Description of the external expert evaluation and conclusion	6
4.	Analysis of compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external evaluation of the educational programme 7R01124 - "Oncology (adult)"	8
5.	Recommendations for improving the educational programme 7R01124 - "Oncology (adult)"	28
6.	Recommendation to the Accreditation Council	28
	Attachment 1. Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation and the educational programme of residency in the specialty of the educational programme 7R01124 - "Oncology (adult)"	29
	Attachment 2. List of documents reviewed as part of the external expert evaluation	30

1. Composition of The External Expert Commission

In accordance with ECAQA Order No. 28 of 07.11.2022, an External Expert Commission (hereinafter referred to as the EEC) was formed to conduct an external programme evaluation of KazRIOR JSC in the period of November 28-30, 2022, consisting of the following members:

n/	Status in the EEC	Full name	Academic degree / title, position, place of work/place of study, course, specialty
1	Chairperson	Kabildina Nailya Amirbekovna	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Professor, Head of the Department of "Oncology and Radiation Diagnostics", oncosurgeon of the State Public Health Institution NJSC "Karaganda Medical University"
2	Foreign expert	Urmanbetov Kubatbek Samyybekovich	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Head of the Department, Deputy Director for Science, Chief Physician, Senior Researcher of the Research Institute of Heart Surgery and Organ Transplantation MoH of the Kyrgyz Republic, Bishkek. Acting Professor at the Kyrgyz State Medical Institute for Advanced Training and Retraining of Personnel of the Ministry of Health of the Kyrgyz Republic
3	Academic expert	Shakirova Aida Fazylovna	Oncologist -gynecologist of the highest qualification category, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, senior resident, oncogynecologist of the Center for Multidisciplinary Surgery of "National Scientific Cancer Center"LLP
4	Academic expert	Urzaev Olzhas Nurlanovich	PhD, Associate Professor, Associate Professor of the Department of "Oncology" of NJSC "West Kazakhstan Medical University named after Marat Ospanov"
5	Representative of employers	Shamsutdinova Alfiya Gumarovna	MD, MSc, BA, Fogarty Fellow, Director of the Children's Medical Center "Helmir Kids", President of the Association of Bioethics and Medical Law, Doctor of the highest category in Public Health Care,
6	Representative of residents	Abylgazieva Aidana Bakytzhanovna	resident of the second year of study in the specialty "Oncology (adult)" of the National Research Educational Institution "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University"

Observer from ECAQA - Umarova Makpal Aldibekovna, Head of the Accreditation and Monitoring Department.

The work of the EEC was carried out in accordance with the Regulation on the EEC (ECAQA Director General's Order No. 4 of 13 February 2017).

The EEC report contains an evaluation of the educational programme 7R01124 - "Oncology (adult)" for compliance with the Standards for primary accreditation of postgraduate education programmes (specialty residency) of medical educational organizations and conclusions (hereinafter referred to as Accreditation Standards), recommendations of the EEC on further improvement of approaches and conditions for the implementation of the above-mentioned educational programme and

recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council.

2. General part of the final report

2.1 Presentation of the residency training programme in specialty 7R01124 - "Oncology (adult)"

Organization name, legal form of ownership, BIN	Joint-Stock Company "Kazakh Research Institute of Oncology and Radiology", 9900240007098
Management body	Governance
Full name of the first manager	Kaidarova Dilara Radikovna
Date of creation	Order of the MoH of the Kazakh SSR No. 1-15-33 dated 05.07.1960.
Location and contact details	Almaty, 91 - Abaya Street Phone: 8 (727) 2921064 E-mail:kazior@onco.kz Official Web site: https://onco.kz/
State license for educational activity in the residency programme (date, number)	No. KZ82LAA00012887 dated 04.03.2010 (without deadline) with Appendices dated 28.09.2018 for educational activities in three specialties of postgraduate education: radiation therapy (radiation oncology), adult oncology and radiation diagnostics
Year of start of the accredited educational programme (EP) implementation	Start year-2022
Duration of training	2 years old
Number of residents in the current academic year	14
Quality indicators in the residency programme	The number of residents under the Oncology Adult programme who were expelled for a period of 5 years is 2, including 2 people for underachievement. Employment rate, % in dynamics over 5 years: 2017 -100 2018 -100 2019 -100 2020 -0 2021 -0
Full-time teachers/ part-timers involved in the implementation of the EP, including % of the settlement rate	Total number of teachers - 11 Settling down rate, % - 72.7 Categorization, % - 100

2.2 Information about previous accreditation

Until now, the accreditation of the educational residency programme in the specialty 7R01124 - "Oncology (adult)" has not been carried out, since JSC " Kazakh Research Institute of Oncology and Radiology "(hereinafter referred to as the Institute) became a part of Asfendiyarov KazNMU and trained from 2019 to 2021 residents of KazNMU in the specialty 7R01124 – "Oncology (adult)". Since 2022, KRIOR is allowed to animate the reception of residents independently.

2.3 Conclusion based on the results of reviewing the report on self-assessment of the educational residency programme in the specialty 7R01124 - "Oncology (adult)" for compliance with the Standards for accreditation of postgraduate education programmes (residency specialty) of medical educational organizations and conclusions

The report on the self-assessment of the educational residency programme in the specialty 7R01124 – "Oncology (adult)" (hereinafter referred to as the report) is presented on 117 pages of the main text, 14-page appendices and electronic versions of documents located at the link <https://onco.kz/> and https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1RT-0EE_7uj6Ph4scoHZ1jegKS-6Jsbo3?usp=share_link

The report is characterized by complete responses to all 9 main accreditation standards and criteria, structured according to the guidelines for conducting a self-assessment of an educational programme provided to an educational organization by the accreditation center-ECAQA, as well as internal unity of information. The report is accompanied by a cover letter signed by Dilara Radikovna Kaidarova, Chairperson of the Management Board, which confirms the accuracy of quantitative information and information included in the self-assessment report.

The report contains a list of 9 members of the internal self-assessment commission with an indication of the responsibility of each employee, information about the representative of the organization responsible for conducting the self – assessment of the educational programme-Yesenkulova Saule Askerovna, MD, Head of the Postgraduate Education Center (PEC) KRIOR.

Self-assessment of the educational residency programme in specialty 7R01124 - "Oncology (adult)" was carried out on the basis of the order of the Chairperson of the Board of JSC "Kazakh Research Institute of Oncology and Radiology" No. 221a dated 08.07.2022. "On the creation of a working group for conducting institutional and specialized accreditation".

The report was reviewed by the accreditation expert A. F. Shakirova, and the reviews noted strengths and areas for improvement, as well as recommendations for additions and changes that were taken into account in the process of feedback from the Institute's representative and the self-assessment report was made appropriate changes and additions.

All standards present the real practice of the Institute for training residents in the specialty 7R01124 – "Oncology (adult)", taking into account the start of admission of students in 2022, reasoned data, examples of the implementation of educational programme tasks, national and international events, methodological support, confirming compliance with the requirements of accreditation standards. The description in the self-assessment report is sufficiently complete and up-to-date in terms of the number of residents, teachers, administration, information about selection and admission, training results, results of knowledge and skills assessment, material and technical base of the university and clinical bases, contractual obligations with partners (universities, associations, bases), financial information, development plans, etc. improvement.

The report is presented in ECAQA in a complete form, with data correction based on the above recommendations, written in a competent language, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable, and described in accordance with the standards criterion, the tables contain links in the text and have end-to-end numbering.

The quality of the self-assessment report served as the basis for moving to the next stage of the accreditation procedure – external evaluation. Experts plan to validate the report data, compare the information from the report with the information that will be received during the visit to the educational organization, i.e., verify quantitative and qualitative indicators.

3. Description of external expert evaluation

External expert work within the framework of the evaluation of the educational residency programme in the specialty 7R01124 - "Oncology (adult)" was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for conducting an external assessment of educational organizations and educational programmes of ECAQA and according to the programme approved on November 21, 2022 by ECAQA Director General S. S. Sarsenbayeva and agreed with the Chairperson of the Board of JSC "Kazakh

Research Institute of Oncology and Radiology" Kaidarova D. R. Dates of visit to the organization: November 28-30, 2022

External evaluation is aimed at validating the data of the self-assessment report and verifying indicators indicating the degree of compliance with the criteria of accreditation standards.

The sequence of implementation of the visit within 3 days is described in detail in the Visit Programme (hereinafter referred to as the programme), which is located in the documentation of the accreditation center. The programme is proof of the implementation of all planned activities within the framework of external expert evaluation.

The following methods and results were used by EEC members to obtain objective information:

- interviews with management and administrative staff – 4;
- interviews with residents – 15;
- exploring a website <https://onco.kz/>
- interviewing 14 employees, 11 teachers, and 6 mentors;
- survey of teachers and residents-10 and 15, respectively;
- observation of the training of residents: attending 3 practical classes:
 1. Topic: Cervical cancer. PEC teacher, head of the Oncogynecology Center E. K. Kukubasov, residents of the 1st year of study in 7R01124 - "Oncology (adult)", venue-resident of the Oncogynecology Center;
 2. Topic: "Discussion of complex clinical cases". Teacher of PEC, head of the operational unit Nasrytdinov T. S., residents of the 1st year of study in 7R01124 - "Oncology (adult)", venue-a meeting room for a multidisciplinary group (MDG) with an interactive whiteboard;
 3. Topic: Planning radiation therapy for a patient with rectal cancer. Teacher of PEC, head of the Radiation Therapy Center Kim V. B. Venue-resident of the Radiation Therapy Center.
- review of resources in the context of meeting accreditation standards: 1 practice/clinical engagement base was visited-Kazakh Research Institute of Oncology and Radiology JSC, where training is conducted in 2 educational programmes with the participation of 2 full-time employees of the Center for Postgraduate Education – Yesenkulova S. A., head of PEC and Dzhakipbayeva A. K., PEC specialist.
- study of educational and methodical documents in the amount of 17 units. both before the visit to the organization and during the visit to the departments (**see Attachment 2 for a list of documents studied**).

On the part of the staff of the accredited organization, the presence of all persons indicated in the visit programme and according to the lists of interview sites and interviews is ensured (Table 1).

Table 1-Information on the number and category of participants in meetings, interviews, and interviews with EEC members

№	Post	Quantity
1	Chairperson of the Management Board	1
2	Deputy Chairperson of the Management Board	2
3	Chairperson of the Council of Young Scientists	1
4	Head of the Center for Postgraduate Education (PEC)	1
5	PEC Employee	1
6	Heads of clinical departments (Centers)	14
7	Residents of the 1st year of study	15
8	Graduates of residency programmes	13
9	Teacher	10
10	Clinical Mentor	6
11	Employer/Chief physician of the cancer clinic	4

On the last day of the visit to the organization, a meeting of EEC members was held on the results of the external evaluation. The final discussion of the results of the external evaluation of the educational programme, the study of documents, the results of interviews, questionnaires was conducted. The EEC members have started to draft the final report of the EEC. Generalizations of the results of external evaluation are made. Experts have individually completed the "Quality profile and external evaluation criteria for the residency training programme in specialty 7R01124 - "Oncology (adult) " for compliance with ECAQA Accreditation Standards". No comments were made by the EEC members. Recommendations for improving the educational programme were discussed and the Chairperson of the Board, N. A. Kabilina, held a final open vote on recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council for the accreditation period of 5 years.

For the work of the EEC, comfortable conditions were created, access to all the necessary information and material resources was organized. The Commission notes the high level of the Institute's corporate culture and the high degree of openness of the team in providing information to EEC members.

When conducting a survey of residents, the majority of respondents (73.3%) believe that it is necessary to conduct accreditation of an educational organization or educational programmes.

According to 90% of teachers, the survey conducted by ECAQA is useful for developing recommendations for improving the key areas of activity of an accredited educational organization.

At the end of the programme of the visit, the EEC Chairperson announced recommendations for the management and employees of the educational organization based on the results of an external assessment within the framework of specialized accreditation.

4. Analysis of compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external assessment of the educational residency programme in the specialty 7R01124 - "Oncology (adult)".

Standard 1: MISSION AND FINAL OUTCOMES

Proof of compliance:

1.1 Mission statement and final results

The mission of KRIOR JSC is: "Reducing the burden of malignant neoplasms by implementing state policies aimed at prevention, early diagnosis, effective treatment, rehabilitation of cancer patients and palliative care, ensuring the implementation of scientific research in the field of oncology, training and retraining of specialists for cancer care in the republic." The mission of the 7R01124 "Oncology (adult)" educational residency programme is aimed at implementing the mission of KRIOR JSC by training a qualified oncologist who has a system of universal knowledge and professional competencies, is capable and ready for independent professional activity in the treatment of oncological diseases.

When implementing the activities of the visit programme, namely, based on the results of an interview with the first head of the organization, members of the Supervisory Board of KRIOR JSC, in interviews with residents and teachers, compliance with the criteria **of standard 1** was established. All participants in the educational process know the mission of the educational programme, took part in the formation of proposals for the formulation of the mission, while the mission was brought to the attention of potential residents through the website, social networks, informational letters to medical organizations. Reviewed the organization's 3-year strategic plan, which confirms compliance with the accreditation standard and demonstrates the organization's goals, objectives, and prospects. From interviews with residents, it is established that before starting classes, teachers inform about the mission, work plans of the educational organization, and tell where to get the necessary information about the educational programme, teachers, and training bases.

During the visit to the departments, experts noted the strengths of the educational organization in relation to the accredited educational programme, including: In accordance with the RoK Government Decree of June 22, 2016, KRIOR JSC has a Supervisory Board. JSC "KRIOR" organizes targeted meetings with employers when coordinating educational programmes, catalogs of elective subjects

(CED); representatives of employers are members of the Clinical Council of JSC "KRIOR", at whose meetings issues related to the implementation of the Mission are discussed.

KRIOR JSC has departments that are directly related to the educational residency programme in specialty 7R01124 - "Oncology (adult)", which can be noted as the best practice in education, namely, surgical centers for: abdominal oncosurgery, thoracic oncosurgery, oncogynecology, breast tumors, head and neck tumors, bone and soft tissue tumors; chemotherapy center; radiation therapy center with tomotherapy; diagnostic departments-pathomorphology with PHC, clinical and laboratory diagnostics, molecular and genetic laboratory, radiation diagnostics department; polyclinic. This conclusion is made, since the implementation of the entire educational programme takes place at one clinical base with full equipment and equipment, the resident does not need to move from one base to another.

The results of studying the documentation demonstrate that the mission of the organization and the mission of the educational residency programme in specialty 7R01124 - "Oncology (adult)", and the educational process are built in accordance with SCES and current regulatory legal acts (NLA) in postgraduate education and health care.

1.2 Professionalism and professional autonomy

Visiting the clinical base, attending open classes, meeting with teachers and residents allowed us to see that by adhering to a patient-centered approach in the clinical process, while maintaining the need for assistance, each resident develops an individual level of such quality as professionalism. The formation of professionalism is formed on the basis of direct training in the workplace, where residents face clinical situations of various levels of complexity, learning from the experience of senior colleagues, and thereby building their own behavior model.

Based on the Law on Education RoK, which establishes the autonomy of higher and postgraduate education organizations, which gives the right, based on the standard rules, SCES 2022, KRIOR JSC determines independently the development of the educational programme, assessment, selection and admission of residents, selection/selection of teachers, employment conditions and resource allocation. Freedom in composing EP is achieved when composing syllabuses, CED, IEP, IEP1, the form, structure and order of development of which is determined by the organization independently. All educational and methodological documentation is reviewed and approved at the EMC PEC KRIOR meetings.

When conducting a survey of 15 residents (on the resource <https://webanketa.com/>), out of 22 questions, a number were devoted to the quality of the educational process and the educational programme. It is established that 80% of residents will recommend studying at this educational organization to their acquaintances, friends, and relatives. And 73.3% of respondents believe that managers of educational programmes and teachers are aware of the problems of students related to learning. To the question "Do you think that the organization of education allows you to acquire the necessary knowledge and skills in your chosen specialty?", 93.3% of residents answered positively, 6.67% are not sure about this, 0% could not answer this question yet, and 0% would like to believe it.

10 teachers surveyed (21 questions of the questionnaire) they also answered that 100% are satisfied with the organization of work and workplace in this educational organization. Experts have determined that the organization has a healthy microclimate, since the manager is quite accessible to both residents and employees, and responds promptly to requests and suggestions. In the questionnaire, 100% of teachers are satisfied with the microclimate of the organization. According to 100% of educational organizations, a teacher has the opportunity to become a professional in their specialty. For your information, a total of 10 people responded (11 in total), while 10% of teachers have up to 5 years of teaching experience, 40% have up to 10 years of teaching experience, and 50% have more than 10 years of teaching experience.

1.3 Final learning outcomes

The EP of the residency programme 7R01124 "Oncology (adult)", developed in the framework of SCES, 2022 and the Qualification Characteristics for the specialty "Oncology" (MoH RoK Order No. 699 of 12.11.2009), takes into account the main final results of the resident's training (NO1- NO6), which interested parties can find on the KRIOR website (<https://onco.kz/>).

At the end of the EP residency training in specialty 7R01124 "Oncology (adult)" of KRIOR JSC, the resident:

able to formulate a clinical diagnosis, prescribe a treatment plan and evaluate its effectiveness based on evidence-based practice at all levels of medical care, conduct differential diagnosis and formulate a conclusion based on the principles of evidence-based medicine, interpret the result of a comprehensive examination of the patient with the development of further recommendations;

- effectively interact with the patient, their environment, and health care professionals in order to achieve the best results for the patient;
- assess risks using more effective methods to ensure a high level of safety and quality of diagnostics.
- act within the right and organizational field of the RoK health care system in the specialty "Adult Oncology", work as part of multidisciplinary teams;
- formulate research questions, analyze scientific databases, draw conclusions and apply the results in your clinical practice;
- learn independently and teach others, participate in discussions, conferences, and other forms of continuous professional development.

The teachers surveyed said that 50% are fully satisfied with the level of previous training of residents, and 40% are partially satisfied.

Experts have established a clear continuity between the final results of previous resident training (prerequisites) and residency training, and subsequent continuing professional development programmes.

Unanimously, 100% of teachers-respondents believe that students of this educational organization have a high level of knowledge and practical skills after completing the training programme.

1.4 Participation in the formulation of the mission and final results

At one time, when talking with residents and employers, experts received a clear answer to the question "Do you participate in the formulation of the mission and goals of the organization, the educational programme?", "What is the personal contribution of residents to improving the educational programme?". To these questions, residents answered that two residents are members of EMC, where the mission and final results of the EP were discussed, and employers answered that they are members of the Supervisory Board of KRIOR JSC, at whose meetings issues related to the implementation of the Mission and final results are discussed.

Conclusions of the EEC on criteria. Out of 17 standards conform: fully – 17.

Standard 1: completed

There are no recommendations for improvements identified during the external session.

Standard 2: Educational programme

Proof of compliance:

2.1 Key parameters of the postgraduate medical education programme

The educational process at KRIOR is organized in accordance with the "Rules for organizing the educational process on credit technology of training" (Order No. 152 of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 20.04.2011).

For the implementation of the educational programme in the specialty 7R01124 "Oncology (adult)", the organization's documents contain EMCs, which define the goal, take into account the integration of practical and theoretical components, and independent work. Compliance with SCES and standard requirements is established. Attending a practical lesson on "Cervical cancer", the duration of which is 50 minutes, the experts received convincing data that the training is carried out according to the plan, before the start of the lesson, residents answer tests, receive feedback from the teacher, and have the opportunity to improve the NO1 skill – the ability to formulate a clinical diagnosis, prescribe a treatment plan and evaluate its effectiveness based on evidence-based practice at all levels of medical

care, conduct differential diagnosis and formulate a conclusion based on the principles of evidence-based medicine, interpret the result of a comprehensive examination of the patient with the development of further recommendations.

The organization ensures compliance with ethical aspects in the implementation of the educational programme, as experts have studied the Academic Policy of KRIOR JSC (Order No. 269-2 of 01.09.2022) and during the interview, residents replied that they were informed about the content of this document.

The analysis of educational activities showed that the scientific basis and all scientific achievements in the advising disciplines were taken into account, additions were made to the EMCD bibliography and syllabuses, and teachers apply them in the classroom.

The mentoring system described in the document "Regulations on Clinical Mentoring" was evaluated. There are 6 mentors in total, whose tasks are to assist the resident in mastering and improving the necessary clinical skills – "on-the-job training".

The procedure for informing residents about their rights and obligations is reflected in the Academic Policy.

This indicates compliance with standard 2 in terms of adapting training to the needs of residents. At the same time, along with the principles of quality and academic integrity, which are described in the Academic Policy document, the organization does not have an anti-plagiarism system.

2.2 The scientific method

At KRIOR, scientific research is a mandatory component of training and involves the integration of educational, practical and research processes, with the result in the form of publications of scientific papers, speeches at conferences of various levels. All students of the residency programme are actively involved in the recruitment, analysis and statistical processing of material by the staff of the PEC clinical departments and teaching staff.

Knowledge of the basics of evidence-based medicine is mandatory in the course of studying for a residency in the specialty 7R01124 "Oncology (adult)". As part of the implementation of the IWR, the EP provides for training residents in the skills of critical evaluation of literature, articles and scientific data by writing essays, presentations in accordance with the thematic plan of the discipline on topical problems of diagnosis and treatment of the most common oncological diseases.

When talking to residents, experts learned that they use scientific data in training and know the basics of evidence-based medicine. Teachers said that they teach residents the methods of critical evaluation of literature, articles and scientific data, as well as the application of scientific developments. This form of training is organized in the form of a "magazine club", which is held once a month.

The survey of residents found that the educational organization has access to students' participation in research work and 73.3% of people are fully satisfied with this, 20% are partially satisfied, 6.67% are not satisfied. Residents should be engaged in research and in the answer to the questionnaire, 60% wrote that they are already engaged in research, 13.3% plan to start, 20% are searching for research topics, and 6.67% are not engaged.

2.3 Content of the residency programme

The content, scope and sequence of EP disciplines of the residency in specialty 7R01124 "Oncology (adult)" correspond to SCES, 2022. EP was reviewed and approved at the EMC meeting of 04.07.2022, Protocol No. 2.

EP in specialty 7R01124 "Oncology (adult)" is designed for 2 years of study (140 credits). Specialized disciplines (Inpatient Oncology-49 credits, Radiation diagnostics in Oncology-7 credits, Radiation therapy-10 credits, Medical Genetics in Oncology – 6 credits, Intensive Care in Oncology – 9 credits, Outpatient Oncology-12 credits, Oncorehabilitology-6 credits, Functional Diagnostics in Oncology – 6 credits Clinical and laboratory diagnostics in Oncology – 6 credits, Pathologic diagnostics in Oncology-8 credits, Palliative Oncology-7 credits and Clinical Immunology in Oncology-8 credits) and an elective component – 4 credits.

There are documents containing requirements for the structure and content of educational programmes, including a standard programme for specialty 7R01124 "Oncology (adult)" in 2022.

The responsibility for selecting and implementing innovations in the educational process is borne by the PEC and teachers of specialized disciplines.

The content of work programmes and the catalog of elective subjects reflect the needs of the health care system, including the training of PHC oncologists-district oncologists, PHC mammologists, chemotherapists, as well as the specifics of research and scientific achievements of teachers. For the successful implementation of the educational programme in the specialty 7R01124 "Oncology (adult)", the organization has resources for organizing the assessment of practical skills of residents (simulation room, assessment of practical skills at the patient's bedside).

Teachers provide residents with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes, in which 73.3% are fully satisfied, 13.3% are partially satisfied, and 13.3% are not satisfied.

The organization has its own clinical base with 430 beds and 8,500 outpatient visits. And to the question of the questionnaire "Is there enough time for practical training (patient supervision, etc.)", 73.33% of residents answered with full consent, 20% partially agree, 6.67% disagree. At the same time, 73.33% of residents claim that after completing classes, the teacher conducts feedback (listens to your opinion, conducts mini-questionnaires, and works on errors).

At the same time, to the question "Do representatives of residents participate in the development of educational programmes?", the experts received the following answer: Yes, they do. Two residents are part of EMC KRIOR.

2.4 Programme structure, content and duration

EP reviewed and approved at the EMC meeting of 04.07.2022, Minutes No.2. The EP of the residency in specialty 7R01124 "Oncology (adult)" is designed for 140 credits: profile disciplines – 134 credits, elective component-4 credits, final certification – 2 credits.

The academic year provides for one academic period ending with intermediate certification (or final certification in the final year). Holidays are granted to students once during the academic year, the total duration of which is at least 5 weeks, with the exception of the final year.

Training in the residency programme includes classroom work, independent clinical work under the guidance of a teacher/clinical mentor, and the student's own independent work (hereinafter referred to as ISW). The volume of classroom work is 10% of the volume of each discipline, independent clinical work under the guidance of a clinical mentor-75%, ISW-15%.

PEC employees analyzed 11 employer questionnaires, 15 resident questionnaires, and 12 graduate questionnaires when forming the elective component: suggestions from students to include the following topics in the catalog of elective subjects: "Reconstructive plastic surgery in oncology", "Innovative methods of cancer diagnosis and treatment". Therefore, CED consists of the above-mentioned disciplines.

The surveyed residents are fully satisfied with the schedule of training sessions (46.67%), 40% are partially satisfied, and 13.3% are not satisfied.

2.5 Organization of training

Responsible for educational activities is also the head of the Center for Postgraduate Education and advisory bodies (EMC and Academic Council). One of the tasks of PEC is to coordinate the interaction of KRIOR's clinical units and ensure monitoring of educational, methodological, therapeutic, diagnostic and advisory activities in order to effectively use the potential of the base's employees in improving the quality of educational services. Training in the KRIOR residency is carried out on the basis of its own clinic, which has all the necessary resources. The clinic passed national accreditation in October 2022.

The management of the educational process reflected in the self-assessment report (**Standard 2**) and general approaches to management were confirmed during a visit to the Postgraduate Education Center and conversations with the manager and employees. At the same time, the verification of **standard 2** showed that there is all the necessary documentation for the implementation of the educational residency programme in the specialty "Oncology (adult)".

Experts got acquainted with the work of clinical units, including the operating unit, the laboratory of tumor cytology, the Center for Morphological Research, the Department of Endoscopy and functional diagnostics, the department of chemotherapy and radiation therapy, the molecular genetic laboratory and the Center for Tomotherapy, a visit to the library. A total of 11 meetings were held and cross-interviews showed that the implementation of the educational programme meets the requirements.

When attending a practical lesson on "Discussing complex clinical cases", in a conversation with residents, experts saw that the organization promotes the development of practical competencies of residents, including on simulation equipment. At the same time, residents deepen their theoretical knowledge and develop communication skills.

To master clinical skills, residents have the opportunity to complete training in departments of various profiles in accordance with the topic of practical classes and those competencies that are defined in the EP of residency in the specialty 7R01124 "Oncology (adult)". By studying at KRIOR, residents have the opportunity to gain knowledge about the organization of cancer services and the scope of medical care at all levels, from primary health care to highly specialized.

2.6 Relationship between postgraduate medical education and health care delivery

7R01124 specialty "Oncology (adult)" training of residents is aimed at meeting the needs of practical health care, since the analysis of the shortage of specialists for 2022 found that there is a need for 10 PHC oncologists. This organization is the flagship in the field of oncology, and provides a lot of opportunities and conditions for qualified training of specialists in this field. Thus, during a conversation with the management of the organization, experts received information that residents are in the clinic from the first day under the supervision of their clinical mentors, and teachers confirmed that the training of residents is carried out directly in the clinical departments of KRIOR. Residents of this specialty can supervise patients with all malignancies both in surgical departments, in the center of chemotherapy and radiation therapy, as well as in the consulting and diagnostic department of the clinic.

This is facilitated by mentoring, which is carried out in KRIOR (Regulations on Mentoring).

Of the surveyed residents, 66.67% answered that teachers use active and interactive teaching methods quite often in the classroom, 13.33% believe that they rarely or sometimes, do not know what it is, doubt and have never used 6.67% each. When visiting an educational organization, experts identified problems in implementing new teaching methods, including TBL, PBL, and CBL.

Conclusions of the EEC on criteria. Out of 30 standards conform: fully -29, partially-1, do not meet-0.

Standard 2: completed

Recommendations for improvements identified during the external session:

1) Expand the use of innovative teaching methods (TBL, PBL, CBL) and reflect them in syllabuses (Standard 2, paragraph 2.1.5.).

Standard 3: Assessment of students

Proof of compliance:

3.1 Evaluation methods

Resident assessment policies and methods are reviewed and approved at the EMC PEC meeting. The general policy, principles, and methods of evaluating residents are reflected in the KRIOR Academic Policy for 2022-2023 (regulations on conducting current academic performance monitoring, intermediate and final certification of residents of KRIOR JSC), approved at EMC (No. 1 dated 20.06.2022).

The system of monitoring academic achievements of residents in KRIOR includes: current and milestone monitoring of academic performance, intermediate certification of residents and final state certification.

Seminars, presentations, practical skills, etc. are evaluated using checklists developed by PEC employees and teaching staff.

The review of control and measurement tools is carried out at several levels-internal-from KRIOR specialists and external review, when employees of external organizations, associations or employers act as reviewers. Reviews are recorded at the EMC meeting. Reviewers of the EP on specialty 7R01124 "Oncology (adult)" were: Esentaeva S. E.-Doctor of Medical Sciences, Head of the Department of Oncology of KRMU, Smagulova K. K.-Candidate of Medical Sciences, head of the day hospital of chemotherapy KRIOR.

The study of control and measurement tools (tests, situational tasks, control questions) showed that KRIOR has implemented a proper assessment policy that allows for a comprehensive assessment of the educational achievements of residents. During the interview, residents talked about the assessment forms, such as the use of assessment sheets to assess practical skills and that they were satisfied with everything. They also receive regular feedback from teachers. The system of appeal of evaluation results is reflected in the document "Academic Policy" and during the period of work of the educational organization, there were no applicants to appeal.

So, to verify the data of **Standard 3**, the experts asked the head of PEC about where the rules for conducting current, intermediate and final certification are prescribed, and checked the documents and methods for evaluating residents. KRIOR has a database of 1000 test tasks compiled by EP developers and approved at the EMC meeting. Control and measurement tools are reviewed by internal and external experts. The head of the Department of Education replied that additions and updates of the CIS are planned to be carried out annually.

During the visit to KRIOR and during the interview with the PEC employee A. K.Dzhakipbayeva, the commission made sure that there is a documentation system that is transparent and accessible to all teachers and employees, and includes such documents as annual operational plans, annual reports, regulations of departments, contracts with teachers and residents, in full educational and practical terms, methodological documentation (EP, working curricula, syllabuses, journals), assessment tools (checklists, sheets), certificates and certifications. A review of the website showed that its pages contain the necessary EMCD for residents and there is information that is regularly updated.

3.2 Relationship between assessment and learning

During the visit to KRIOR, the EEC members confirmed that the methods of assessment of residents are comparable to the methods of teaching and learning and cover the assessment of all competencies of students, both during practical classes and during exams.

The results of the residents' assessment are documented as follows: assessment sheets are filled in, the assessment is displayed, and entered in the journal.

The Institute evaluates the reliability and validity of assessment methods by examining assessment sheets on an ongoing basis, analyzing and approving tests.

When conducting interviews with 10 teachers regarding assessment methods, experts received convincing information that an objective assessment of theoretical knowledge should be carried out using an oral survey and testing, practical skills using checklists. Residents also shared their opinion on the timeliness of providing tests, conducting counseling before exams, understanding the entire assessment procedure and its fairness.

During the visit to KRIOR, the management was asked: "Are external examiners involved in order to improve the fairness, quality and transparency of the assessment process?". And the answer was received that during the Final state certification of residents, leading specialists from practical health care are involved as Chairperson and members of the SAC. So, for the period of graduation of residents in 2016-2020, the commission includes leading professors, KRIOR employees, representatives of other universities, and practical health care.

The experts examined the resources for organizing the assessment of knowledge and practical skills, namely, a simulation center with assessment sheets for each practical skill.

The interviewed 4 representatives of employers also pointed out that the training of KRIOR graduates corresponds to the modern development of medical practice and science, since residents are trained in a clinic with all powerful human resources and the necessary full equipment to provide qualified and high-tech care to cancer patients. Employers said that they themselves participate in the

assessment of residents, as they are included in the examination boards. But the educational organization did not conduct systematic feedback with them. Employers believe that the skills of graduates of the residency programme, such as critical thinking and communication skills, they wanted to see the strongest.

The EEC conclusions on the criteria. Out of 11 standards correspond: fully-11, partially-0, do not meet-0.

Standard 3: completed

There are no recommendations for improvements identified during the external session.

Standard 4: Students

Proof of compliance:

4.1 Admission and selection policy

KRIOR has a policy on the admission of residents, which is called "Academic Policy".

The head of PEC spoke about the policy of accepting residents. Approaches to the admission of residents are based on the requirements of the country and internal regulations, namely, Admission to the residency programme is carried out in accordance with the Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of RoK "On approval of the Standard Rules for Admission to study in educational organizations implementing educational programmes of higher and postgraduate education" dated October 31, 2018 No. 600, SCES RoK-2022 and Rules for admission to the KRIOR residency programme for the current academic year.

Applications for the residency programme are accepted from July 3 to July 25. Entrance examinations for the residency programme are held from August 8 to August 16, and enrollment is held until August 28. Residency classes start on September 01. Admission of citizens to the residency programme is carried out on a competitive basis based on the results of entrance exams. Applicants to the residency programme pass an entrance exam in their specialty. When applying for a residency programme, the applicant's personal achievements, results of research work, etc. are also taken into account. The key role in assessing the previous level of education is played by the entrance exam in the specialty, which includes 4 sections evaluated on a 100-point assessment scale, where:

- 30% is the sum of the average GPA score for the internship period (15%) and the average GPA score in the bachelor's degree (15%) or GPA for all 6-7 years of study (if there is no GPA in the transcript, the average score for the application is calculated (converted to a 4-point scale);

- 30% - assessment of the 1st stage of the final state certification (FSA) of course 6-7 (independent testing conducted by NCIE); an applicant from another university brings an assessment of the first stage of independent testing signed by the head and stamped by the training organization; if the applicant did not have an independent testing assessment in the year of completion of the internship, the applicant passes testing in NCIE according to the selected EP before submitting documents to the admissions committee.

- 30% - entrance exam in the specialty in the scope of the previous education programme, which includes situational tasks in the profile specialty, related disciplines and is formed on the basis of standard programmes in higher education disciplines on the issues posted on the website;

- 10% - availability of scientific publications in peer-reviewed journals (including CCES) with an electronic link to the publication.

Admission to the residency programme is carried out based on the results of the entrance exam for the profile and those who have scored at least 50 points out of a possible 100 points for the paid department. Persons who have scored the highest points in the entrance exam are eligible for training under the state educational order on a competitive basis: for residency-at least 75 points. Assessment of knowledge based on a point-rating system, taking into account all forms of activity – scientific, educational, etc. - ensures the validity of the resident admission procedure and guarantees the availability of the necessary basic knowledge of applicants.

According to the Rules of admission to the residency programme in the 2022-2023 academic year, in the case of the same indicators of competitive points, the persons who have the highest score in the specialty receive a preferential right to enroll, in the case of the same indicators of the entrance exam in the specialty.

The duration of mastering the educational programme of residency in specialty 7R01124 "Oncology (adult)" is 2 years.

On the KRIOR website <https://onco.kz/> information materials on admission are presented – a list of documents, programmes for admission; Academic policy, catalog of elective subjects, academic calendar, schedules. The page is accessible to an external user.

The number of residents is determined based on the possibilities of clinical training, as well as the needs of practical health care.

In 2022, KRIOR enrolled 17 students of the residency programme in 2 specialties. Of these, 13 are provided under the grant, and 2 are paid for as part of a targeted order for local executive bodies of regions that need specialists.

Thus, the experts validated the data according to **standard 4**. In general, all the criteria meet, there are no shortcomings. Experts got acquainted with the documentation on the admission of residents, including the "Academic Policy" of KRIOR. Experts interviewed clinical mentors about the practice of academic counseling, personal support for residents, and the development of other professional skills. The organization has a resident development programme that includes residents in advisory bodies such as EMC and the Council of Young Scientists.

4.2 Number of residents

The number of accepted residents is regulated by the MoH RoK State Order for the Training of Medical Personnel and taking into account the possibilities of clinical and practical training, the maximum allowable load on the Institute's teaching staff, the availability of educational, methodological and scientific literature, as well as the material and technical resources of the Center.

Since KRIOR JSC became a part of NJSC "KazNMU", since 2019, all residents are admitted to NJSC "KazNMU" by state order, and therefore since the 2019 academic year there has been no admission of residents.

4.3 Support and advice to residents

During a conversation between EEC experts and resident oncologists, it was established that KRIOR has created and provides safe training conditions for residents. To protect the interests of residents and provide them with assistance in academic, scientific, and extracurricular activities, KRIOR provides various services for organizing counseling, psychological, social, and medical support for students. EEC experts have confirmed that experienced teachers and professors are involved in the consultation. In addition, before the start of each module, the group teacher informs its residents about the schedule of their work, the time when residents can seek advice on this discipline.

For personal growth and development, sports and creative events, the team has a sufficient resource base (Internet, 100% WIFI coverage of the center's territory, library, computer classes, reconstructed and improved territories of the center's buildings). The study rooms are equipped with projectors, a screen, a video wall, and all necessary office equipment.

Implementation of the residency training programmes in the specialty 7R01124 "Oncology (adult)" will be ensured by free access of each resident to information resources and library collections, availability of methodological manuals and recommendations for all modules, disciplines and all types of academic work.

To develop the intellectual level of residents and expand their knowledge in various scientific fields, KRIOR residents take an active part in the International Scientific and Practical Conference and Congresses of Oncologists and Radiologists held annually by the Institute. Residents are involved in the work of the Council of Young Scientists, which also addresses emerging issues.

4.4 Resident representation

During the conversation with the head of PEC, it was found out that the quality of the implementation of the educational programme is ensured by the participation of residents in the

discussion of the EP mission, which is available through posting on the KRIOR website. EMC, along with supervisors and teachers, includes residents to participate in the review of issues related to the educational process and approval of training materials for residency, the development of an individual working curriculum and elective subjects. This fact was also confirmed by residents during their interviews.

When visiting the EEC Institute experts, it is confirmed that feedback is collected from residents at the stage of mastering the taught discipline (at the end of studying the discipline), as well as on issues related to learning/working conditions, problem situations.

During the PEC visit, the results of a survey of students, teachers, and graduates were demonstrated. Residents' suggestions for improving the educational process: the inclusion of lectures in the curriculum for the 2023-2024 academic year is an urgent issue and a popular measure for both residents and teachers; the content of lectures on disciplines should be problematic and focus students on the main issues of the discipline taught; it is recommended to use mixed forms of organizing lectures (remotely/offline, depending on the discipline taught and specific topic) the optimal duration of one lecture is 1 academic hour. The overwhelming majority of residents note the demand for lectures.

4.5 Working conditions

Combining training with work (no more than 0.5% of the rate) in areas of activity close to his future specialty, in his free time, is allowed with the consent of the curator, head of the department and PEC.

If you have a specialist certificate, residents of the 2nd year of study are allowed to conduct independent medical activities in public and private medical institutions, during extracurricular hours.

During the visit to the clinical base, the EEC experts found that residents have unlimited access to patients, all types of medical equipment and all departments of the clinical bases. The center has rooms for conducting theoretical classes with residents, there is a separate room for changing clothes, eating, etc.

During their training, residents of the specialty "Oncology (adult)" actively participate in consultations, MDG, medical conferences, pathoanatomical conferences, clinical reviews, master classes, scientific and practical conferences.

The academic load of residents is planned in accordance with the RoK Law "On Education". The class schedule from 08.00 to 17.00 hours is regulated by the EP developed on the basis of SCES 2022, sanitary and epidemiological rules and regulations, curricula and recommendations of health and education authorities.

Residency work is the main and dominant responsibility of a resident.

In EP, a balance of all types of activities is observed: patient care in the hospital, work in the emergency room, work in outpatient settings. A schedule for the resident's stay in a particular clinical unit of the Institute is drawn up. For residents with work experience, an individual learning path can be provided (when rotating by department), and the choice of elective discipline also affects the learning path.

Conclusions of the EEC on criteria. Out of 30 standards conform: fully-30, partially-0, do not meet-0.

Standard 4: completed

There are no recommendations for improvements identified during the external session.

Standard 5: Academic staff/ Faculty

Proof of compliance:

5.1 Recruitment and selection policy

The EEC experts confirmed that, according to the SCES (as amended in 2022), persons assigned to resident doctors to master the necessary theoretical and practical skills are appointed from among the teaching staff and/or practical health workers with an academic degree, first or highest qualification category, who have appropriate training in the field of medical education.

The activities of specialists engaged as KRIOR faculty and employees are carried out in accordance with the internal labor regulations and job descriptions approved by the director of the center. The composition of teachers and clinical mentors is approved by the Chairperson of the Board of KRIOR or a person authorized by him annually, taking into account the new admission for the corresponding academic year. According to the KRIOR development programme, the personnel policy of the center is implemented taking into account the goals and objectives of the Institute.

The main indicators that characterize specialists engaged as teaching staff for residents are the following characteristics: the presence of an academic degree and title, scientific and pedagogical experience and experience in the position held, activity in scientific and methodological and research work, etc. The selection of teaching staff in accordance with the established requirements, analysis of the quantitative and qualitative composition of teaching staff, monitoring and evaluation of teaching activities are the objects of constant attention on the part of the center's management. The staff of the residency teaching staff is determined in accordance with the main provisions of the Order of the Minister of Health RoK of June 14, 2004 No. 474 "On approval of the norms for calculating the cost of training for one student, residency student, master's student, doctoral student (PhD) in educational organizations and scientific organizations in the field of healthcare within the country under the state educational order".

During the visit to PEC, it was established that for the successful implementation of the residency training programme in the specialty 7R01124 "Oncology (adult)". in the 2022-2023 academic year, 11 employees were involved, including 2 professors, 5 associate professors, 12 mentors, 91% having the highest qualification categories in their specialties, and more than 5 years of clinical and research experience of teaching staff. Experts are familiar with the PEC Regulation (Protocol"1a of 17.06.2022), the Regulation on mentoring (Protocol 3 of 01.09.2022).

In order to verify the data of standard 5, external experts obtained the opinion of teachers on personnel policy, which includes the policy of recruitment and admission of teachers and clinical mentors, stimulation and motivation of practical health professionals. The conversation with B. T. Mukurshina, head of HR Department of KRIOR, included such questions as how specialists are involved and motivated in educational activities and allowed experts to learn about approaches to attracting employees of the clinical base for teaching (there are 11 such teachers in total), about the strategy and tactics of recruiting teachers, information security of the educational programme, as well as identify problems related to management and development of human resources, as most part-timers do not know the teaching methodology.

In a survey of teachers, it was found that only all (100%) are fully satisfied with the organization of work and workplace in KRIOR. In this educational organization, teachers have the opportunity to engage in scientific work and publish research results - 100% completely agree. Satisfied with the salary - 60% fully agree, 30% partially disagree, 20% disagree.

5.2 Teacher commitment and development

During the conversation between the EEC experts and representatives of the management staff, it was established that the personnel policy of the National Center for Development of Personnel consists in planning, developing measures to encourage and reward achievements in work. Types of incentives and the procedure for their application are determined by the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

One of the priority areas of development of KRIOR teaching staff is to improve the level of pedagogical skills. Teaching staff have the opportunity to take various scientific and practical trainings and internships. During the reporting period, 3 employees received advanced training in pedagogy in the following cycles: "Methodology of education in healthcare", "Effective communicator", "Development of communication skills of teachers of clinical disciplines in higher education institutions", "Training of teaching staff of clinical departments of higher education institutions", etc.

In order to verify the data of standard 5, during a meeting with the head of the HR department, B. T. Mukurshina, and during an interview with teachers, experts received an opinion on approaches to the development of pedagogical competence of teachers, motivation to work with residents, mentoring,

which includes organizing cycles of teacher training (certificate of completion of a cycle of 60 hours), financial incentives in the form of employee bonuses.

The experts received answers about the teacher training programme that all 11 PEC teachers completed in the amount of 60 hours in 2021, but the clinical mentors involved in the implementation of the educational programme did not pass. These events are funded by the Institute. An expert has verified the above-mentioned certificates.

Experts found that teachers initiate research topics for residents, stimulate the need for additional training and independent work with literature and medical documentation. Confirmation of this fact was obtained during a conversation with residents.

There is an opportunity for career growth and development of teacher competencies in the organization – 100% of the surveyed teachers answered that they agree with this. 60% of students were trained in professional development programmes during this year, while 40% were trained more than 3 years ago.

The organization implements social support programmes for teachers – 70% said that "yes, there are such programmes", 20% of respondents said that they doubt it, and 10% of respondents do not know about it.

Conclusions of the EEC on criteria. Out of 7 standards conform: fully – 5, partially-2, do not meet-0.

Standard 5: completed

Recommendations for improvements identified during the external session:

1) Provide advanced training courses for curators and clinical mentors (Standard 5, paragraphs 5.2.2, 5.2.4.).

Standard 6: Educational resources

Proof of compliance:

6.1 Logistics and equipment

KRIOR has a well-developed material and technical base for professional training of residents in the specialty 7R01124 "Oncology (adult)". The adequacy of the material and technical base of KRIOR, the number and profile of patients to ensure the clinical training of residents is ensured by all structural divisions of KRIOR involved in the implementation of the EP. The material and technical base of KRIOR includes: large and small conference halls, study rooms, a library, a clinical laboratory, cytology and pathomorphology laboratories, a molecular genetic laboratory, all clinical departments, including two departments that are the only ones in Kazakhstan - the department of bone and soft tissue tumors and the department of tumors head and neck surgery, chemotherapy department, radiotherapy department with a unique fleet of equipment in Kazakhstan (conformal, stereotactic, IMRT, IGRT, RapidArc), PET center, tomosynthesis center,

During the visit to KRIOR, the experts visited the library, all clinical departments, the molecular genetic laboratory, the tomotherapy center, and the pathomorphology center, where they received confirmations for each item concerning the material and technical equipment of the Institute necessary for the implementation of the EP residency in the specialty "Oncology (adult)".

6.2 Clinical databases

A review of KRIOR resources showed that they correspond to the goals and objectives of educational activities, and employees provide a collegial and ethical relationship with medical staff, the management of the clinical base to achieve the final results of resident oncologists. A sufficient number of thematic patients with cancer pathology are provided, modern equipment and medical accessibility are provided to students, and employees who simultaneously perform the roles of teachers and clinical mentors provide high-quality training in compliance with ethics and deontology. Before starting the relevant discipline of the educational programme, the resident receives a syllabus from the teacher and knows what skills they should acquire and develop during their training.

During the visit to KRIOR, where experts conducted a survey of resources, their compliance with the training programme of resident oncologists, accessibility for teachers and ECAQA_ The Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health care has 20 residents, as far as this equipment is modern and meets the needs of students and practical health care. Experts have obtained evidence of compliance with Standard 6, as well as validation of the self-assessment report information.

In order to validate the implementation of the self-assessment report data and obtain evidence about the quality of EP residency in the specialty "Oncology (adult)", interviews were conducted with resident oncologists. Experts asked questions about satisfaction with training, sufficient time for patient supervision, work in Damumed with medical documentation, satisfaction with teaching methods and teacher qualifications, social and moral support for residents in need, participation in " Magazine Clubs", availability of international databases of professional literature as a resource. In general, residents are satisfied with the training and assessment methods, and purposefully enrolled in KRIOR, as they believe that this educational organization has good resources, image and international connections, while at the same time residents would like more independence in managing patients and conducting international events.

Residents showed their commitment to KRIOR, were active in answering questions from external experts, demonstrated their judgment on the organization of training, assessment of their skills, advisory support, opportunities to participate in research, financing, demonstrated English proficiency when answering questions from a foreign expert Urmanbetov K. S. Experts studied resident documents (portfolio, results of resident assessment-check lists, results of residents ' surveys).

6.3 Information technology

KRIOR has state-of-the-art server stations. They provide information security for the functioning of the center's network, the work of registered users with e-mail, as well as open access to educational information resources on the Internet for all teachers and students from any computer connected to the telecommunications network.

When preparing educational and methodical literature, teachers use the library's educational resources (electronic textbooks, electronic manuals, scanned educational literature), the Internet, as well as the results of their own scientific and research activities.

Also, in KRIOR there is an opportunity to hold conferences, meetings, classes in a remote format. For this purpose, special Microsoft teams 365 and Zoom programmes are used, which provide free communication between teachers and residents via the Internet. For efficient document management, KRIOR has implemented "Documentologist", which integrates and organizes all the processes of the Institute's structural divisions in an automated mode. Since 2020, KRIOR has signed a contract with the DamuMed information system. All employees of the center have access to this system.

6.4 Clinical teams

Every day, resident oncologists participate in joint rounds with mentors, consultations, MDGs, and consultations with other specialized departments. Residents also conduct seminars on topical issues of clinical medicine themselves, where students of all levels, as well as health care workers and teaching staff, attend.

Students and residents develop coordination skills to work with colleagues and other healthcare professionals during examination, patient care, and especially when providing care to patients.

Students have free access to patients on clinical bases and all conditions for improving their practical skills-100% of teachers fully agree with this.

6.5 Medical research and development

The scientific research of the staff of KRIOR branches is the basis for the scientific work of residents. Currently, KRIOR is working on two research projects funded by the ROK Ministry of Health – "BRCA-associated breast and ovarian tumors" and "Immunity Research for HPV-vaccinated patients". During the conversation with the residents, it was found out that they take an active part in the implementation of these scientific projects.

Given that KRIOR is a scientific and practical center, residents and teaching staff regularly use the scientific developments of the center in providing medical care to cancer patients.

Interviews with 10 teachers, including 10 full-time teachers, showed that there are no problems in the management of education, depending on the specific base (access of residents to equipment, a sufficient number of thematic patients, time for maintaining medical records, independent work).

6.6 Expertise in the field of education

In order to ensure the quality of educational programmes, KRIOR has created an educational and methodological council, which includes teachers, leading clinical staff, administrative and managerial staff, and residents.

In addition, according to the requirements of national accreditation, the Institute has a quality management system service for monitoring clinical performance and minimizing medical errors, but there is no monitoring of the quality of educational activities. Evaluation and approval of educational programmes and modules is carried out at EMC.

The objectives of KRIOR include: development of educational activities. The goals of the educational programme are interrelated with the development of a quality culture at the Institute. Quality control over the implementation of educational programmes is carried out in accordance with the internal audit plan and orders of the PEC supervising the educational process and the Deputy Chairperson of the Board for Scientific and Strategic work of KRIOR.

During the examination, it was revealed that the criteria for evaluating the EP residency in the specialty 7R01124 "Oncology (adult)" were not developed

Expertise is carried out in the form of an analysis of the needs for specialists, an analysis of the methods of training residents, and the results allow us to draw conclusions about the quality of innovative changes in postgraduate education.

6.7 Training in other institutions

Memoranda have been signed with foreign clinics to support international cooperation, exchange of resident doctors, and exchange of experience in the field of medical education, including training and seminars for specialists and residents.

KRIOR cooperates with scientists and institutes from Italy, France, the USA, South Korea, Georgia, Latvia, Mongolia and other countries.

Experts have established that there is no jointly developed EP residency in the specialty 7R01124 "Oncology (adult)" with partner universities.

Conclusions of the EEC on criteria. Out of 21 standards conform: fully-21, partially-0, do not correspond-0.

Standard 6: completed

There are no recommendations for improvements identified during the external session.

Standard 7: Programme evaluation

Proof of compliance:

7.1 Monitoring and evaluation mechanisms

After analyzing the educational programme of the residency programme in specialty 7R01124 "Oncology (adult)", the EEC experts found that the internal system for ensuring the quality of education in KRIOR is provided by PEC. Evaluation and improvement of the EP is carried out with the participation of all stakeholders, which include leading teachers, experts in the field of medical education, employers, as well as students.

The head of the PEC manages, organizes, coordinates the work of all departments and is responsible for the implementation of educational programmes.

This activity is carried out in accordance with the regulatory documents of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan, as well as internal regulatory documents: 1) Laws of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education", "On

Science"; 2) Order of the Acting Minister of Health and Social Development of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 31, 2015 No. 647 On Approval of State mandatory standards and Standard professional training programmes in medical and pharmaceutical specialties, as amended in 2022

d; 3) "Standards and recommendations for quality assurance of higher education in the European Area", developed by the European Association for Quality Assurance of Higher Education ENQA; 4) Charter. It was also noted that there is no monitoring of innovative teaching methods in the EP residency in the specialty 7R01124 "Oncology (adult)".

7.2 Faculty and resident feedback

PEC has implemented a system for monitoring the quality of the educational programme by studying feedback from students, trainees, teachers, employers and applying the results of feedback analysis to improve educational programmes. Feedback contains information about various aspects of the educational process, information about unfair practices or inappropriate behavior of teachers or students. The work on providing feedback to students is carried out through questionnaires and meetings. According to the regulations, the survey is conducted on a regular basis (once a year) in accordance with the work plan for monitoring the quality of the educational process for the current academic year. The main principles of the survey of consumers of educational services provided by PEC are:

1. Compliance of the questionnaire content with the strategic goals and objectives of the Center.
2. Anonymity of participation.
3. Systematic and consistent survey procedures.
4. Use standardized survey procedures and criteria.
5. Continuity.
6. Informative content.

The survey is conducted according to the following types: "Teacher through the eyes of students", "Students' satisfaction with the conditions and results of training", "Satisfaction with infrastructure", "Graduate satisfaction with the quality of training", "First-year student questionnaire". The survey is conducted online via Google, as well as on paper. The coverage of respondents in various questionnaires ranged from 75% to 95%.

Based on the results of the survey "Teacher through the eyes of students", a report and reference are compiled for each teacher with an assessment of students. Materials of the survey of all interested parties (students, employers, teachers) are discussed at EMC and an analytical report based on the results of the survey is considered. The report data is analyzed, compared with real facts, cause-and-effect relationships are clarified, and then a decision is made to make changes to the organization of the educational process, EP.

For the purpose of feedback, the PEC conducts an annual survey of employers. Thus, the degree of satisfaction of employers with graduates of the Institute is assessed to determine whether the educational programme meets the real requirements of the labor market, opportunities for its improvement, as well as the degree of compliance of graduates' competencies with workplace positions.

7.3 Results of residents and graduates

An important role in the evaluation of the educational programme is played by the results of the final certification of residents conducted at the testing stage by the National Independent Examination Center, as well as the results of certification exams conducted by the Control Committee for Medical and Pharmaceutical Activities of the Ministry of Health and Social Development of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

In the specialty 7R01124 "Oncology (adult)", the final state certification is planned to be carried out in 2 stages: determining the level of theoretical training in disciplines in the form of testing; certification of practical skills with a standardized patient.

During the conversation with 13 graduates of different years from 2016-2019 of the EP residency in specialty 7R01124 "Oncology (adult)" of KazNMU, who were trained at the KRIOR clinical base, who work in KRIOR as oncosurgeons, oncogynecologists, chemotherapists, radiation oncologists, it was found out that they all passed an Independent examination from the first time with good results.

Also, in the course of communication between experts and employers about the quality of knowledge and practical skills of graduates of the KRIOR residency programme, they note their level is an order of magnitude higher than graduates of other universities.

7.4 Stakeholder engagement

All stakeholders (faculty, residents, employers) are involved in the EP assessment process through representation in the relevant structures (Supervisory Board, EMC). The work of all structures that ensure the implementation and evaluation of the educational programme is regulated by the strategic development plan of the Institute, annual plans and reports. Evaluation results are heard at EMC meetings.

Interviews with 4 employers were conducted online and included such questions as: knowledge of the university's mission, participation in the development of the mission and proposals for the strategic plan, participation in the work of advisory bodies, satisfaction with the basic knowledge and skills of residents, participation in the training of residents through mentoring, providing the department and residents with the necessary resources for practical training and formation clinical thinking, problems of interaction with departments and universities in general, 100% employment of residency graduates, etc.

7.5 Procedure for approving educational programmes

The educational programme for the specialty 7R01124 "Oncology (adult)" is developed in accordance with the SCES and the Standard Curriculum for this specialty.

KRIOR has developed mechanisms for approving educational programmes that provide for evaluating programmes at the stages of planning, implementation, analyzing results and implementing changes, which allows monitoring the EP implementation process and the progress of residents, and provides identification and timely resolution of emerging problems.

The EP is examined by a PEC specialist for compliance with SCES, approves the QED according to the proposals of stakeholders and taking into account pre - and post-requirements, and evaluates the choice of methods for evaluating residents' learning outcomes. PEC carries out a systematic study and comprehensive assessment of the EP in order to improve and guarantee quality (determining the value of the programme, achieving the goal, implementing tasks, the degree of compliance with the needs of society, the requirements of employers, the effectiveness of training methods), as well as evaluating the educational support and support of the educational process, and evaluating the quality of the EP. For this purpose, an external assessment of the EP is carried out by a competent representative of practical health care.

Conclusions of the EEC on criteria. Out of 15 standards conform: fully – 15, partially-0, do not meet-0.

Standard 7: completed

There are no recommendations for improvements identified during the external session.

Standard 8: Governance and Administration

Proof of compliance:

8.1 Management

The guarantee of implementation of EP specialty 7R01124 "Oncology (adult)" is its strict compliance with the requirements of regulatory rules regarding the admission of residents (selection criteria and number), the learning process, assessment of knowledge and skills, established learning outcomes, programme management, which are regulated in the Republic of Kazakhstan by the MoH RoK and MES RoK regulations. KRIOR's internal documents are developed on the basis of national regulations.

Graduates of the 7R01124 "Oncology (adult)" residency programme who have passed the FSA are awarded the qualification of oncologist, chemotherapist and issued a state-issued certificate of completion of the residency programme, in accordance with the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of RoK dated January 28, 2015 No. 39 "On approval of types and forms of state-issued

educational documents and their Rules", Article 5 of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education" dated July 27, 2007. Based on the certificate of completion of the residency in the specialty 7R01124 "Oncology (adult)", graduates can obtain a specialist certificate without exams.

All activities related to the implementation of the EP are carried out under the direct control of the PEC. The Chairperson of the Management Board and Vice-Chairperson for Scientific and Clinical work constantly monitor the availability of PEC with the necessary resources. The Institute's administration regularly conducts interviews with teaching staff and residents.

In KRIOR, transparency of management and decision-making is guaranteed. Participation of teaching staff in the management of KRIOR is ensured by the opportunity to be elected to the collective management bodies. Collective management bodies, each at their own level and within their competence, resolve various issues of KRIOR's activities and its structural divisions: approve long-term and current work plans; listen to reports of divisions (centers, sectors).

The collective management bodies of KRIOR include: the Supervisory Board, the Academic Council, the Educational and Methodological Council, the Local Ethics Commission, and the Council of Young Scientists. Residents and teachers are members of SC, EMC and the Council of Young Scientists, where they can take an equal part in the discussion and solution of all issues.

8.2 Academic leadership

The structural divisions of the Institute responsible for monitoring and managing the educational process in the specialty 7R01124 "Oncology (adult)" are PEC. The center is managed by a manager appointed and dismissed by the order of the Chairperson of the Management Board in accordance with the procedure established by the current labor legislation and internal regulatory documents of KRIOR. The main objective of the department is to carry out continuous organizational, coordination and administrative work aimed at achieving the goals and objectives set for KRIOR.

Structural divisions in the implementation of their activities are in cooperation with the PEC to improve the scientific activities, publishing activities of teaching staff. The responsibilities and responsibilities of KRIOR employees engaged in educational activities are determined by Job Descriptions. Also, the Institute's Management Board annually analyzes the achievement of strategic goals based on monitoring targets and indicators, assessing its strengths and weaknesses (SWOT analysis), on the basis of which they determine the quality assurance policy, develop strategic and operational plans, provide information for effective management regarding the achievement of the mission of residency programmes, indicators for educational activities, etc. expected final learning outcomes.

100% of the teachers answered yes to the questionnaire "Do the organization's managers listen to your opinion regarding issues related to the educational process, research, and clinical work?"

8.3 Training budget and resource allocation

Determining the financial and economic policy of KRIOR and the management structure of the Institute is the responsibility of the first head of the center – Chairperson of the Management Board of KRIOR JSC.

The Center allocates the resources necessary for the implementation and implementation of educational programmes and distributes educational resources in accordance with needs. The Institute's budget for science and education is formed from the republican budget (state order for training postgraduate education personnel, development of scientific research, transfers). Funding for the residency programme depends on the formation of an annual state order. Every year, the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan approves the state educational order for training specialists with higher and postgraduate education, in accordance with which funding for programmes, in particular residency programmes in the specialty 7R01124 "Oncology (adult)", is determined.

Experts found out that the center plans to introduce and implement EP specialty 7R01124 "Oncology (adult)" on a paid basis (LEB).

8.4 Administration and Management

The hierarchy of the Department of Education is reflected in the structure of KRIOR, in which the teaching staff in the specialty 7R01124 "Oncology (adult)" is subordinate to the PEC, which is

subordinate to the Deputy Chairperson of the Management Board for Scientific and strategic work, and the deputy in turn reports to the Chairperson of the Management Board, and the Chairperson to the Board of Directors, the Board of Directors – to the Sole Shareholder – MOH RoK. The hierarchy of educational activities is also reflected in the PEC Regulation.

KAZNIIR operates a clinical audit, management and quality service, as well as a quality department that conducts regular internal and external reviews and audits, but they do not provide educational processes. The Clinical Audit, Management and Quality Service reports to the Chairperson of the Management Board and reports with an analysis of the current situation and corrective measures are provided directly to the Chairperson of the Management Board.

The system of internal assessment, monitoring of the teacher's work and achievement of intermediate and final results of educational programmes is carried out through the certification of teaching staff in all types of activities. The external review is carried out by the DSHR and RCHD, which annually request data on ranking indicators among research centers implementing postgraduate education programmes, as well as when passing accreditation.

8.5 Requirements and regulations

The Institute determines and approves the educational programme for the specialty 7R01124 "Oncology (adult)" according to SCES MoH RoK No. 647 dated 30.06.2019. The programme is approved in close cooperation with all interested parties. The structure and content of the WEPI correspond to the SCES specialty 7R01124 "Oncology (adult)", the programmes of the disciplines are developed at the proper scientific and methodological level. The sequence of studying the residency disciplines is constructed using a system of pre - and post-requirements.

Conclusions of the EEC on criteria. Out of 15 standards conform: fully-13, partially-2, do not meet-0.

Standard 8: completed.

Recommendations for improvements identified during the external session:

1) Introduce a full-time unit of the management and quality system for teaching activities in the existing Department of management and quality (Standard 8, paragraph 8.4.2, 8.4.3.).

Standard 9: CONTINUOUS RENEWAL

Proof of compliance:

KRIOR always strives to respond in a timely manner to changing internal and external conditions. In order to continuously improve the educational process, in accordance with the best practices of the world educational management, taking into account the needs of practical healthcare, RoK regularly initiates a review and update of processes.

To implement the competence-based model of medical education and ensure continuous improvement of the quality of the educational process, there are structures – PEC, EMC, and the Council of Young Scientists.

A convincing example of the process of continuous improvement of approaches to the implementation of educational residency programs is the active participation of stakeholders (primarily representatives of employers) in the formation of an educational strategy that reflects the social responsibility of the Institute for the development of advanced innovative technologies in practical medicine and science, the use of information and communication technologies, as well as the strengthening of public health care.

Develop organizational structure, management, and management to address the changing circumstances and needs of post-graduate training, and collect the interests of various stakeholder groups over time.

A strategic plan for improving educational activities for 2023-2024 is being developed:

1. Development of a policy in the field of quality of educational programmes of residency and pre-residency and additional education;
2. Policy on monitoring the quality of educational programmes;

3. The policy of interaction with employers;
4. Introduction of new simulation training technologies, implementation of activities to create a simulation center;
5. Teaching staff and clinical mentors pedagogical skills.

The conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria: Out of 4 standards conform: fully-4, partially-0, do not meet-0.

Standard 9: completed

Recommendations for improvements identified during the external session no.

Thus, when conducting an external assessment of the educational residency programme in the specialty 7R01124 – "Oncology (adult)", compliance with 142 accreditation standards was established, including 89 basic standards and 53 improvement standards. 5 basic standards and 3 improvement standards were partially implemented. No non-compliance with the standards has been established. The implementation of improvement standards indicates that the educational organization complies with the international consensus.

5. Recommendations for improving the educational programme of residency in specialty 7R01124 - "Oncology (adult)":

1. Expand the use of innovative teaching methods (TBL, PBL, CBL) and reflect them in syllabuses (Standard 2, paragraph 2.1.5.).
2. Provide advanced training courses for curators and clinical mentors (Standard 5, paragraph 5.2.2, 5.2.4.).
3. Introduce a full-time unit of the management and quality system for teaching activities in the existing Department of management and quality (Standard 8, paragraph 8.4.2, 8.4.3.).

7. Recommendation to the ECA Accreditation Council

The members of the EEC came to a unanimous opinion to recommend to the Accreditation Council to accredit the educational programme 7R01124 "Oncology (adult)" of JSC "Kazakh Research Institute of Oncology and Radiology", corresponding to the Standards for accreditation of educational programmes of the residency of medical educational organizations for the period of 5 years

Chairperson of the EEC

KABYLDINA NAILYA AMIRBEKOVNA

Foreign Expert

URMANBETOV KUBATBEK SAMYYBEKOVICH

Academic Expert

SHAKIROVA AIDA FAZYLOVNA

Academic Expert

URAZAEV OLZHAS NURLANOVICH

Expert Employer

SHAMSUTDINOVA ALFIYA GUMAROVNA

Expert-Learner

ABYLGAZIEVA AIDANA BAKY TZHANOVNA



The image shows seven handwritten signatures in blue ink, each placed above a horizontal line. The signatures are arranged vertically on the right side of the page, corresponding to the names listed on the left. The signatures are: 1. A stylized signature starting with 'K'. 2. A signature starting with 'U'. 3. A signature starting with 'S'. 4. A signature starting with 'U'. 5. A signature starting with 'S'. 6. A signature starting with 'A'. 7. A signature starting with 'A'.

Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation of the educational programme (summary)

Standard	Evaluation criteria	Number of standards	Rating			
			Basic standards/ Standards Improvements	Fully compliant	Partially compliant	Not compliant
1.	MISSION AND END OUTCOMES	17	10/7	10/7		
2.	EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMS	30	22/8	21/8	1/0	
3.	ASSESSMENT OF STUDENTS	11	7/4	7/4		
4.	STUDENTS	30	18/12	18/2		
5.	ACADEMIC STAFF / FACULTY	7	5/2	4/1	1/1	
6.	EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES	21	10/11	10/11		
7.	PROGRAM EVALUATION	15	10/5	10/5		
8.	GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION	15	8/7	8/5	0/2	
9.	CONTINUOUS RENEWAL	1	1/0	1/0		
	Total:	147	91/56	89/53	2/3	

List of documents reviewed by EEC members as part of the external evaluation of the residency training programme

No	document names	Number
1.	Organization structure of KROR	1
2.	Approval of the mission of educational activities of KROR	1
3.	Regulations on EMC (Educational and Methodological Council)	1
4.	Regulations on the Center for Postgraduate Education	1
5.	Academic policy KROR	1
6.	Educational programme in the specialty 7R01124 - "Oncology (adult)"	1
7.	Reviews of the EP	2
8.	Catalog of elective subjects	1
9.	Protocols of approval of the main EMCD on the STP	2
10.	Syllabuses (by discipline)	10
11.	Control and measurement tools-tests, situational tasks, exam tickets, syllabuses	10
12.	CMI reviews	2
13.	Resident portfolios	14
14.	Individual resident plans	14
15.	Teaching staff documents (portfolio)	11
16.	Code of Honor of teaching staff	1
17.	Questionnaires and results of a survey of employers and students on the modification of educational programmes and satisfaction with the educational process	3